

# Networking and interaction between a Mutual Assistance Association and other agencies (Pamplona, 1902–1919)

Pilar Leon Sanz

## Introduction

We have referred on an earlier occasion to the diverse medical healthcare systems that co-existed in Spain at the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>1</sup> During the 19<sup>th</sup> century there was a change from a social assistance appropriate to the old regime to a humanitarian model more in keeping with the Liberal State. Particularly from the 1880's, the reformist and hygienist movements, the statutory provisions and the socio-economic conditions brought about change in the assistance organization. These reforms were also due to the fact that the Liberal public care model left much of the population unprotected, as it only covered those families that were on the poor list.

The development of social prevision in Spain had always been connected with worker associationism and with those movements which arose from the social doctrine of the Catholic Church, as promoted by Pope Leon XIII. In fact, the impact of the papal encyclical *Rerum novarum* (1891) in Spain is well-known, both in the Krausist and Liberal-Conservative media. Both groups, while having different philosophical views, shared an organicist and harmonical perspective on society. Under their wing were begun the initiatives for popular education and the first projects for social protection legislation which led to the passing, in 1900, of the Law on Labour Accidents and the regulation of working conditions for women and children.

In this context, the Mutual Benefit Societies were a collective means of voluntary prevision, developed separately from the State. Some of these societies had their roots in the old guilds, others in the *Montepíos*, but the majority was new, and was

---

1. León Sanz, Pilar, "Professional Responsibility and the Welfare System in Spain at the Turn of the 19th Century", *Hygiea Internationalis*, 5: 1 (2006), 75–90.

encouraged by the 1887 Law on Associations. In absolute numbers, the highest figure for members and organizations was between the years 1896 and 1906. With the passage of time, these Mutual Benefit Societies changed their structure and objectives.

Complementary to these Mutual Benefit Societies, in the more industrialized areas of Spain, such as Vizcaya, some companies organized health care for their employees. And, with the appearance of the first law on private insurance, passed in 1908, the slow development of private health insurance companies began.

It is evident that the development of social prevision in Spain was clearly marked by international inspiration. Initially the debate focused on the Bismarckian mandatory insurance system, but when the National Institute of Prevision (INP) project was being designed, between 1903 and 1906, it also took into account the Italian and Belgian systems, which were based on collaboration with private initiatives, particularly with the *Cajas de Ahorro* (savings banks). In the end, the National Institute of Prevision, which came into being in 1908, maintained its subsidiary relationship with the State in the promotion of social security.<sup>2</sup>

In general the medical and social assistance offered by charitable organizations, private or public systems, such as la *Beneficencia* and later the Social Health Services, tended to have separate historiographical approaches. When dealing with Spanish mutualism, the historiographical perspective on case studies is characteristic, because, although there were exceptions, the development of the Mutual Benefit Societies was limited by law to the local area.<sup>3</sup>

Nonetheless, assistance in an urban area is the sum of the different systems and organizations, together with the less formal initiatives and activities promoted by individuals and families. This essay focuses on the social networks that supported the assistance and labour associations. This complex phenomenon was more or less institutionalised, such that we need to examine the local context in order to comprehend the dynamics of the associations, which are of great interest for general history.

Several important studies have analysed the situation of medical and social associations in Navarra at the time of the Spanish Restoration<sup>4</sup>, but I wish to focus

---

2 Montero, Feliciano, “El debate sobre el intervencionismo y el nacimiento del Instituto Nacional de Previsión (INP)”, pp. 171–196 in: *La previsión social en la historia: actas del VI Congreso de Historia Social de España: Vitoria, 3–5 de julio de 2008*. Madrid: Siglo XXI de España, 2009.

3 Andreu Martínez Gállego, Francesc and Ruzafa, Rafael, “Los socorros mutuos y la cooperación en la España del siglo XIX: actitudes de los poderes públicos y soluciones populares” pp. 101–135 in Santiago Castillo and Rafael Ruzafa, eds., *La previsión social en la historia: actas del VI Congreso de Historia Social de España: Vitoria, 3–5 de julio de 2008*. Siglo XXI de España. Madrid, 2009.

4 Ferrer Muñoz, Manuel, “Panorama asociativo de Navarra entre 1887 y 1936”, pp. 49–65 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988. Pejenaute Goñi, Javier María, “Las

specifically on the interaction between the Workers' Mutual Benefit Society *La Conciliación*, the most important workers' association in Pamplona, and other public and private organizations between 1902 and 1919.

Until 1920, The Catholic Workers Protection Society *La Conciliación* was formed by an association of workers from each trade, made up by employers and a mixed group of tradesmen, employers and protectors. The main objective of *La Conciliación* was to be a mutual illness and unemployment protection society.<sup>5</sup> First, I will describe the relations of *La Conciliación* with other assistance organizations (mutual aid associations), specifically the interaction that *La Conciliación* had with the different workers' societies. Further, I will discuss the relations *La Conciliación* had with public bodies, and refer to the web of public figures involved in the Society.

## Relations between *La Conciliación* and other Associations and Mutual Aid Societies at the Beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century

### La Conciliación and other Mutual Aid Associations in Pamplona

On issues of medical care for its members, *La Conciliación* habitually cooperated with the mutual aid societies and guilds in Pamplona: the Craftsmen's Guild, the oldest in the city, founded in the latter half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century; the Workers' Union and the Sodality of the Passion, and so on. But records clearly show that *La Conciliación* was fiercely independent in its criteria and actions on the varied matters.

*La Conciliación* employed physicians from the Craftsmen's Guild and also asked the Hermandad (Sodality) of the Passion for doctors. These societies even worked together in cooperation when, in 1916, they agreed to exchange their sick leave lists

---

Sociedades de Socorros Mutuos en Navarra (finales del siglo XIX-Comienzos del XX)", pp. 273–287 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988.

5. León Sanz, Pilar, "La concertación de la asistencia en la enfermedad en La Sociedad de Obreros *La Conciliación* (1902–1919)", pp. 97–108 in *Navarra: Memoria e Imagen*. Eunete, Pamplona, 2006. León Sanz, Pilar, "Higienismo y previsión social a través de una Sociedad de Socorros Mutuos: el Consultorio de Niños de Pecho de "La Conciliación" (1905-1916)" CD: Comunicaciones, pp. 1-23, in Santiago Castillo and Rafael Ruzafa, eds., *La previsión social en la historia: actas del VI Congreso de Historia Social de España: Vitoria, 3-5 de julio de 2008*. Siglo XXI de España. Madrid, 2009. León Sanz, Pilar, "Private initiatives against social inequalities and health vulnerabilities: the case of *La Conciliación* (Pamplona, 1902–1920)" in Patrice Bourdelais and John Chircop, eds., *Vulnerabilities, Social Inequalities and Health*. Évora, Edições Colibri, forthcoming.

in order to avoid fraud in the payment of aid. It was true that payment of aid from more than one organization could add up to more than a day's wage, which meant that people were in no hurry to be discharged.<sup>6</sup> The Societies also confronted crisis situations together, such as the 1918 influenza epidemic, at which point they demanded subsidies from the Town Council. And when, that same year, the Official Medical Council of Navarre was negotiating a rise in physicians' fees, these organizations joined to carry out the negotiations. But in the end, as *La Conciliación* was aware of the bargaining power it had due to its greater membership, it came to an independent agreement with the Medical council on more advantageous fees.

Despite all this, their good relations continued, as we can see when in 1919 the Master of the Craftsmen's Guild, don Claudio Lozano, asked the President of *La Conciliación* (J. Sánchez-Marco) about their experience and conditions of the pharmaceutical service, etc.<sup>7</sup>

This harmony among the Mutual Aid Societies in Pamplona is surprising, as they were, to a certain extent, rival organisations: they all offered medical assistance and had similar ideologies. Nevertheless, they did share some members who, voluntarily, belonged to more than one organization. This was beneficial to *La Conciliación* because of the subsidiary character of its medical assistance. Possibly, this attitude of cooperation among the Mutual Aid Societies is comprehensible, as we shall see, because of the personal relations of those who directed the organizations.

## La Conciliación and the Workers' Societies in Pamplona

Very different was the attitude of *La Conciliación* towards the workers' associations (without the employers' intervention). Its attitude was one of confrontation, independently of their political line or ideology. The period studied here was marked by conflicts and disagreements, both with the Federation and with the Free Catholic Union.

This behaviour is logical as the relations with these organizations refer to labour aspects, and in this area, their attitudes were disparate. *La Conciliación* was a mixed association with different employers' associations as members, and it wished to resolve labour conflicts by negotiating between the employers and the workers, while the workers' societies proposed other measures.

---

6. La Conciliación, *Books of Minutes* (1902–1923). *Pro manuscript*. Archive University of Navarra. (Cited: LCBM, number book, page). In this case: LCBM 6, 35, (1916)

7. LCBM 8, 123 (1919).

From the start, *La Conciliación* was firmly opposed to the *Federación Local de Sociedades Obreras de Pamplona*,<sup>8</sup> and numerous confrontations arose between both workers' groups. For example, the records for March 8<sup>th</sup> 1903 state:

Receipt is acknowledged of the note from Eugenio Lacunza and Julio Goñi who were dismissed by their boss, who has employed three workers from the federation and it is agreed that the President will call this gentleman so he can be heard and a favourable solution for the workers will be sought.<sup>9</sup>

Soon it was declared impossible for the members to belong to both institutions. And with the passage of time and the increase in friction, the suspicions of solidarity with the Federation endangered a worker's continuing in *La Conciliación*. Thus, for example, a member who had been seen at the May 1<sup>st</sup> demonstration, organised by the Federation, was expelled.<sup>10</sup> And the incompatibility was extended to the physicians of *La Conciliación*, who, in 1917, were forbidden from attending patients from *La Conciliación* and from the Federation, unless they were attending the surgery as private patients.<sup>11</sup>

This shows an emphatic rejection of the Socialist initiative, even though the Federation did not declare itself to be socialist until the beginning of the 1920's.<sup>12</sup> In fact, J. Andrés-Gállego warns that the federated unions of the time,

declare their religious, political and economic asepsis, and that each of these unions admit all and every worker, with any and every idea, on all matters, as long as they agree to be united against the outrages of the capitalists.<sup>13</sup>

The resistance societies, Severino Aznar insists in 1909, "are subscribed to by anarchists, both believers and non-believers".<sup>14</sup> Moreover, there is unanimity that, in Pamplona, Socialism did not become a social force until 1923<sup>15</sup>, which explains why

---

8. About this Worker's Society: Virto, Juan Jesús, "La UGT", p. 244 in Alfredo Floristán Samanes, *Gran Atlas de Navarra*, II. Caja de Ahorros de Navarra, Pamplona, 1986. Pazos, Anton M., *El clero navarro (1900–1936): origen social, procedencia geográfica y formación sacerdotal*. Pamplona, 1990, pp. 74–75

9. LCBM 1, 37–38 (1903).

10. LCBM 4, 73 (1916); 5, 147 (1917).

11. LCBM 5, 153 (1917).

12. Virto Ibáñez, Juan Jesús, "La UGT de Navarra: algunas aportaciones al estudio del socialismo navarro", *Príncipe de Viana*. Pamplona, 1989, 395–429 (396).

13. Andrés-Gállego, José, *Historia contemporánea de Navarra*. Pamplona, 1982, pp. 105–108.

14. Aznar Embid, Severino, *El riesgo-enfermedad y las Sociedades de Socorros Mutuos*. Madrid, 1914.

15. Pejenaute Goñi, Javier M, "La Federación Católico Social de Navarra y los partidos políticos del momento (1910–1916)", *Príncipe de Viana, I Congreso de Historia de Navarra de los siglos XVII, XIX y XX*. XXXVII: 5, Anejo (1986): 37–51. Tuñón de Lara, Manuel, "Navarra en los movimientos sociales de la Historia Contemporánea de España", *Príncipe de Viana, I Congreso de*

the number of members in *La Conciliación* at the time was far higher than those of the *Federación*. However, although in Navarre Socialism was of little importance, this was not so for the rest of Spain or the world, where Socialism was the principal adversary of Catholic institutions, and justified the attitude of *La Conciliación*. The *Sindicato Católico Obrero Libre*,<sup>16</sup> created in 1915, after the visit of Father Pedro Gerard to Pamplona on the occasion of The Sixth Social Week in 1912, because of the rise in horizontal associationism, received the same treatment.<sup>17</sup>

The tensions between the two institutions are easily comprehensible, as their programmes were contradictory. The members of the *Sindicato Libre* were extremely spirited: they did not hesitate to go on strike and argued with other unions, with the employers, and also with *La Conciliación*. They had polemical discussions with *La Conciliación* in the local press, to the point that the *Sindicato Libre* went so far as to proclaim the end of the Mixed Societies. This explains why *La Conciliación* expelled those who joined the *Sindicato Libre*, with no possibility of redress. Thirty-six members were expelled between 1915 and 1920 for this reason.<sup>18</sup>

Surprisingly, both the *Federación* and the *Sindicato Libre* made consecutive labour proposals to *La Conciliación*, of both negotiation and protest. Thus, the Mixed Board received invitations to participate in demonstrations and in negotiations to demand labour improvements. In each case, *La Conciliación* apologized for not taking part, as the Society was a mixed one with employers among its members.

In 1918, *La Conciliación* changed its strategy regarding the *Sindicato Libre*. So, for example, it re-admitted some members as it considered they had been “duped” into joining the *Sindicato Libre*. Joint actions were also undertaken. The records of the Mixed Board of *La Conciliación* for May 1919 show the petition of the Tailors and Commerce Guilds in favour of a merger with the *Sindicato de Obreros Libre*, in order to carry out joint actions against *La Federación*.

Shortly afterwards, we find a petition from the Carpenters Guild for *La Conciliación* to join up with the *Federación* and the *Sindicato Libre*, to order to force the reduction of working hours and other labour improvements.<sup>19</sup> In answer, the Mixed Board again states its position. It advises that, although occasionally, “*in extremis*, some joint agreements have been made”, *La Conciliación* is incompatible

---

*Historia de Navarra de los siglos XVII, XIX y XX*. XXXVII: 5, Anejo (1986): 9–22; Andrés Gállego, José, “Sobre el inicio de la política obrera contemporánea en Navarra, 1855–1916”, *Príncipe de Viana*, 1978, pp. 335–375.

16. Carrasco Calvo, Salvador, “Los Sindicatos libres en Navarra”, *Príncipe de Viana, I Congreso de Historia de Navarra de los siglos XVII, XIX y XX*. XLVII: 5, Anejo (1986): 53–67.

17. Calavia Urdániz, Ana, “*La Conciliación* de Pamplona y sus relaciones con los sindicatos católico-libres (1915–1923)”, *Príncipe de Viana*, XLIX: 10 Anejo (1988): 73–84.

18. LCBM 5, 147 (1917).

19. LCBM 8, 22 (1919).

with the resistance societies. *La Conciliación*, as it has always done, will support the petitions of the guilds, but in its own way.<sup>20</sup>

In fact, *La Conciliación* preferred to intervene in the problems by using its influence both on employers and on employees. Two relevant examples: Pamplona was one of the few places in Spain where the workers' protest march organized in 1917 failed, although it was massive in other cities. And the above-mentioned demand by the Carpenters Guild ended up in a meeting where the President and the Secretary of the employers association informed the Bricklayers, Stonemasons, Tinsmiths, Painters, Carpenters, Woodcarvers, Gilders, Cabinet-makers and Turners Guilds of the improvement which had been agreed.<sup>21</sup>

There was one exception in its dealing with the workers' societies. *La Conciliación* had extremely cordial relations with the *Sindicato de Obreras de Nuestra Señora del Camino* (a working-women's association), that was allowed to use the Society's premises for their meetings. In exchange, the women made the *La Conciliación* flags and emblems. The relationship between the two associations became less friendly when *La Conciliación* wanted to charge for the use of its assembly hall.<sup>22</sup> We must also note that as it was a women's society, it was not a rival of importance for *La Conciliación*.

## La Conciliación and Associations in Navarre and other Provinces

*La Conciliación* was not an isolated initiative; it had relations with other organizations promoted by Social Catholic activists in Pamplona. Outstanding was its close collaboration with the workers' Centro Dominical, founded and maintained by Eustaquio Olosa in Pamplona, in 1881, attended by between 300 and 400 day-labourers. Its aims were education (several physicians in the city participated in pedagogical work) and the promotion of savings (it assisted in negotiations with the Savings Bank - *Caja de Ahorros*).<sup>23</sup> A few months after it was inaugurated, the Mixed Board appointed Eustaquio Olosa as Honorary President of *La Conciliación*, "due to his merits relevant to his work in favour of the workers". In 1914 the *Centro Dominical* was taken over by *La Conciliación*,<sup>24</sup> which implies that both organizations had a project in common, that is, directed towards the same group.

---

20. LCBM 8, 37 (1919).

21. LCBM 8, 37 (1919).

22. LCBM 4, 20 (1912).

23. The rules of this institution were published in *Boletín del Consejo Nacional de las Corporaciones Católico-Obreras*, II: 2 (1897), 2. About the Centro Dominical: José Andrés-Gallego, *Historia contemporánea de Navarra*. Pamplona, 1982, p. 104.

24. LCBM 1, 17–18 (1903).

In 1906, after the visit to Pamplona of Padre Vicent, the Diocesan Council of the Catholic-Worker Corporations was set up, to which the President of *La Conciliación* belonged, at least until 1908.<sup>25</sup> Together with other responsibilities, this Council had to approve the credit unions, unions and other initiatives that were formed in the diocese.

*La Conciliación* also collaborated closely with other Navarrese organizations such as the *Círculos Católicos* in Estella, Peralta, etc.<sup>26</sup>, and with the flourishing new Navarrese agrarian cooperativism.<sup>27</sup> Thus, as a symbol of its support of the initiatives of *La Conciliación*, the Federation of Rural Savings Banks donated 50 pesetas to the campaign for funds to introduce old age insurance.<sup>28</sup>

*La Conciliación* was in correspondence with many associations, mutual aid societies and *Círculos Católicos* in the rest of Spain, such as those in Santander and Vitoria, etc. Over the years, it worked regularly with the *Consejo Nacional de Corporaciones Católicas Obreras de España*.<sup>29</sup> Moreover, *La Conciliación* was proposed as a model in national assemblies and congresses. For example, José de Posse y Villelga mentioned *La Conciliación* as the prototype for mixed associations of workers and employers.<sup>30</sup>

In the minutes of the Mixed Board we can read decisions like the following: in November 1905,

it is agreed to send 20 copies of the regulations which were requested by Don Pedro Igoa in Santa Cruz de Tenerife.<sup>31</sup>

There were also requests for Regulations and experiences from other places (as the *Patronato de Acción Social Popular de Melilla*, etc.).

---

25. *Diario de Navarra*, 31 July 1906, 14 August 1906, 18 September 1907. *El Pensamiento Navarro*, 2 July 1906.

26. Pejenaute Goñi, Javier María, “Las Sociedades de Socorros Mutuos en Navarra (finales del siglo XIX-Comienzos del XX)”, pp. 273-287 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988.

27. The Navarrese agrarian cooperativism has been studied by: Pejenaute Goñi, Javier María, “Las cooperativas de Consumo y producción en Navarra (1907-1917)”, pp. 257-271 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988. Pejenaute Goñi, Javier, “Participación del clero en la Federación navarra de Cajas Rurales”, pp. 369-376 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988. Majuelo Gil, Emilio; Pascual Bonis, Angel, *Del catolicismo agrario al cooperativismo empresarial: setenta y cinco años de la Federación de Cooperativas Navarras, 1910-1985*. Madrid, 1991.

28. LCBM 5, 51 (1915).

29. LCBM 1, 310-312 (1905).

30. Posse y Villelga, José de, *Estudios sociales. El socialismo, sus hombres, su organización, sus procedimientos. La Asociación Agrícola, Las Uniones Profesionales. Los Obreros de Tierra de Campos*, Bilbao, 1912, p. 192.

31. LCBM 1, 380-381 (1905).



In 1908, an association was created in Burgos (a city in Castile) with the same name, aims and organizational model as the one in Pamplona. The Burgos association was made up of Workers Guilds, Employers Guilds and, above them, a “Council for conciliation and arbitration”, with an equal number of representatives of the guilds (workers and employers) and protector members.<sup>32</sup> And in the same group, we have to place the *Asociación Obrera León XIII*, the San Salvador del Valle, in the mining area of La Arboleda in Vizcaya (1906), the *Asociación Católica Obrera* of Laguna de Duero, near Valladolid, and the *Asociación General de Empleados de Vizcaya*. These groups had links with: the *Asociación Católica de Obreros* of Avila (1908); the *Asociación Obrera Pío X* of Abanto y Ciérvana, in Gallarta in the coalfields of Vizcaya (1909); the *Asociación Los Obreros* in Chelva (Valencia, 1910); the *Asociación de Obreros* of Begoña (Retuerta, 1911); and the *Asociación Católica de Obreros Mineros* which was begun in the area of La Hullera, in Asturias, in 1912.<sup>33</sup>

All these groups shared the objectives and characteristics of *La Conciliación*, although not all of them attained the same levels of assistance. Of importance is the *Asociación de León XIII* because, in 1912, it had a credit union, a Secretariat for the village, a savings bank, a consumer co-op, a school mutual benefit society, and was planning a fund for unemployment.

The correspondence between these societies shows a clear dynamic of collaboration that went beyond mere institutional or inspirational relationships: the Section of the *Workers’ Federación Local de Sindicatos Católicos* in Tolosa writes to *La Conciliación* several times requesting funds for striking workers. *La Conciliación* joins in sending signatures asking for pardons for workers. Moreover, *La Conciliación* participated in the testimonial mobilizations which were so typical of the time: it collaborated with pilgrimages or public demonstrations that similar groups organized from Bilbao. It also kept up correspondence with the *Asociación para el estudio y defensa de los intereses de la clase obrera* in Madrid and with the *Biblioteca Católico-Propagandista*, to which it gave premises for its library.

## Institutional Mediation

On the political landscape of the region, the “foral” regime and the *Diputación* (provincial government) were of particular importance as Navarre had a special

---

32. About this institution: Castrillejo Ibáñez, Félix, “El Círculo Católico de Burgos como modelo de sociabilidad confesional (1883–1936)”, pp. 237–262 in Elena Maza Zorrilla, ed., *Asociacionismo en la España contemporánea: vertientes y análisis interdisciplinar*. Valladolid, 2003. Delgado Viñas, Carmen, *Clase obrera, burguesía y conflicto social: Burgos, 1833–1936*. Valladolid, 1993.

33. Andrés-Gállego, José, *Pensamiento y acción social de la Iglesia en España*, Madrid, 1984, pp. 298–299.

regime of administrative autonomy from the central government. This regime stated that the *Diputación Foral de Navarra* was an executive group that depended on the parliament, the legislative body. The *Diputación* was directly responsible for matters such as the social welfare of the region.<sup>34</sup>

In the early part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, there was a majority of conservative parties both in the local and regional government, although not all of these supported *La Conciliación*.<sup>35</sup> However, we can say that the Society had government backing and institutional aid. *La Conciliación* demanded aid from the Town Council and the *Diputación* because “the Association saved these corporations a great deal of money in Beneficence and other expenses”.<sup>36</sup>

For example, the Society co-op participated in the reduction of the price of milk, coal and other basic supplies which was promoted by the Town Council in 1915,<sup>37</sup> etc.

In spite of the fact that, in its records, *La Conciliación* repeatedly emphasized its apolitical and neutral character, appropriate for this type of associations, it did, in fact, play an active role in the political and social life of the city. Representatives of *La Conciliación* belonged to the Commissions which both the Town Council and the *Diputación* set up in order to solve the sanitary and social problems in the city. Some examples are that, year after year, during this period, a member of *La Conciliación* was elected as a worker representative on the local Board for Social Reform. The Society gave its backing to the measures, such as the building of the railway, adopted to palliate the unemployment situation, and Members of the Mixed Board of *La Conciliación* intervened in the campaigns to promote the construction of cheap houses and the demolition of the city walls. They were also involved in the Subsistence Board organized by the Civil Government when confronted by the shortage and high cost of foodstuffs.

They also corresponded directly with important figures on the central Government (ministers, Cortes, and so on) to give their opinions or to congratulate

---

34. This situation was established by the *Ley de Modificación de Fueros* (or *Paccionada*) in 1841, it changed in 1984.

35. About the political configuration of the region cf.: Andrés-Gallego, José, *Historia contemporánea de Navarra*. Pamplona, 1982. Olabarri Gortazar, Ignacio, “Notas en torno al problema de la conciencia de identidad colectiva de los navarros en el siglo XIX”, pp. 339–356 in *Congreso de historia de Euskal Herria*, San Sebastián, V, 1988. Olabarri Gortazar, Ignacio, “Notas sobre la implantación, la estructura organizativa y el ideario de los partidos del Turno en Navarra, 1901–1923”, *Príncipe de Viana*, 10 Anejo (1988), 317–329; Mina Apat, M Cruz, “Elecciones y partidos en Navarra (1892–1923)”, pp. 111–129 in José Luis García Delgado, *La España de la Restauración. Política, economía legislación y cultura*. Madrid, 1985. García-Sanz Marcotegui, Angel, “Elites económicas y políticas en la Restauración. La diversidad de las derechas navarras”, *Historia contemporánea*, 23 (2001), 577–628.

36. LCBM 5, 152 (1915).

37. LCBM 5, 152 (1915).

them on decisions taken, as in the case of the telegrams sent to the Council of Ministers on the decision on the building of the extension to the city (in 1914) or Spain's neutrality in the European War, in 1917.

There is no doubt, as we have seen, that their cooperation with the most important public institutions was in relation to medical-social affairs: they organized vaccination campaigns, the Mother and Baby Clinic, they were part of the Anti-tuberculosis Committee, of the Healthcare Board, the Provincial Board for the Protection of Children of Navarre, among others.<sup>38</sup> And the attention paid to the worker-members and their families during the influenza epidemic demonstrates the complementary nature of the mutual aid societies, including *La Conciliación*, in the socio-sanitary assistance to the people of Pamplona.<sup>39</sup>

## The network of personal relations

The relations *La Conciliación* had with public and private bodies described here were, to a large extent, arguably due to the personal contacts of the protector members. Indeed, it has frequently been said that this important social support provided substantial economic aid which permitted the development of the Society. This support, both at a local and a national level, was obtained because the original members of the Mixed Board were well-known members of the Navarrese bourgeoisie, with links to the conservative parties.<sup>40</sup> Some, apart from having held political posts, had influential professional careers: the first President of *La Conciliación*, Miguel García Tuñón, had been the mayor of the city (1885–1886, 1897–1901) and was a lawyer in the capital; Fernando Gorosabel presided the consortium between 1895 and 1897; Rafael Gaztelu, also, was city mayor in 1872 and the records show that he personally obtained important donations for *La Conciliación*. So, in January 1903, we read: “a donation of 1,000 pesetas was received thanks to Mr. Rafael Gaztelu, from the testate proceedings of Doña Balbina Jiménez de Cénarbe”.<sup>41</sup> Juan José Seminario was a Carlist, proprietor of a store and he also belonged to the municipal corporation (1897, 1905).<sup>42</sup> The

---

38. LCBM 1, 223–224 (1904). León Sanz, Pilar, “Private initiatives against social inequalities and health vulnerabilities: the case of *La Conciliación* (Pamplona, 1902–1920)” in Patrice Bourdelais, John Chircop, *Vulnerabilities, Social Inequalities and Health*. Évora, forthcoming.

39. León Sanz, Pilar, “Diversity and Convergence in practice: the Mutual Benefit Societies’ Responses to the 1918–19 Influenza Pandemic in Pamplona”, in *Health and Welfare: diversity and convergence in policy and practice*, PHOENIXTN Conference Athens, 2009.

40. Andrés-Gallego, José, *Pensamiento y acción social de la Iglesia en España*. Madrid, 1984, p. 12.

41. LCBM 1, 15–16 (1903).

42. Andrés-Gallego, José, *Navarra cien años de historia*. Pamplona, 2003, p. 49.

following gives us an idea about some of this backing, and emphasises the links between *La Conciliación* and the newspapers.

## Local Support

Some of the local celebrities who favoured *La Conciliación* were the above-mentioned Eustaquio Olaso; the Carlist politician Luis de Bobadilla, who, 1903, gave a donation of 1,000 pesetas;<sup>43</sup> the architect-archaeologist Florencio Ansoleaga (1846–1916), co-founder of the “Basque Association” of Navarre and a member of the Provincial Health Board. He was a person of some influence in the City Hall, and, in his will, left the sum of 25,000 pesetas to the Mutual Aid Societies of the city, including *La Conciliación*;<sup>44</sup> Miguel Ciganda, a founder member of the Chamber of Commerce and Industry, when he was the Mayor of Pamplona publicly praised the work of *La Conciliación* and offered his support.<sup>45</sup>

Of note is the collaboration with *La Conciliación* of other physicians in the city, for example, Manuel Jimeno Egurbide, then provincial manager of the Navarrese Healthcare Service (1905–1924), who supported the vaccination campaign and the Mother and Baby Clinic promoted by the Society.<sup>46</sup> This Navarrese hygienist is a clear example of the network of relations and influence established in the city. Apart from creating a professional journal, *La clínica médica* (1884–1889), which included articles by many professionals, he was one of the promoters of the journal *La Ilustración Navarra*, with other significant personalities of the times, such as A. Campión, J. Cancio Mena, M. Cayuela, Nicanor Espoz, Rafael Gaztelu, J. Iturralde y Suit, among others, all of whom had relations with *La Conciliación*. Moreover, Dr. Jimeno worked as the director of the newspaper *El Liberal Navarro* (1887–1890) and participated in the Centro *Dominical de Obreros* (1890) with the army physician Nicasio Landa. He was a good friend of the then physician in Artajona and Republican “foral” county councillor for Estella, and later President of *La Conciliación*, Silvestre Goicoechea Ataun, as can be seen in the fact that he dedicated his doctoral thesis to him (1883).

---

43. LCBM 1, 61–63 (1903). About this politician, Sanchez Aranda, José Javier, *Navarra en 1900: los comienzos del Diario*. Pamplona, 1983, p. 112.

44. LCBM 6, 293 (1914). About this figure, Andres-Gallego, José, *Navarra cien años de historia*. Pamplona, 2003.

45. LCBM 1, 355–357 (1905). Sanchez Aranda, José Javier, *Navarra en 1900: los comienzos del Diario*. Pamplona, 1983, p. 66.

46. See León Sanz, Pilar, “Private initiatives against social inequalities and health vulnerabilities: the case of *La Conciliación* (Pamplona, 1902–1920)” in Patrice Bourdelais, John Chircop, *Vulnerabilities, Social Inequalities and Health*. Évora, forthcoming.

## The Media

The activities of *La Conciliación* were widely reflected in the local press. In general, the Carlist newspaper *Pensamiento Navarro* and the *Tradición Navarra* did not always favour the Society, while the more liberal ones such as *El Eco de Navarra* and *Diario de Navarra* did. Other figures, such as Atanasio Mutuverría, founder of the *Caja Agrícola de Tafalla* and director of the newspaper *El labrador*, allowed *La Conciliación* to use the papers for the Society's aims;<sup>47</sup> and Juan Iturralde y Suit (1840–1909), a multitalented character, who, from a moderate and traditionalist position, played an active role in municipal politics and was a co-founder of the Asociación Euskara de Navarra, also arranged the appearance of *La Conciliación* in other periodicals with which he had relations: *El Arga*, *La Paz* and *Lau buru*.<sup>48</sup> Importantly, the *Diario de Navarra*, founded in 1903 and which quickly became the major local newspaper, expressed the views of *La Conciliación*. It was used to broadcast news, for promotion campaigns and to attract new members, and to announce the actions it undertook for social or healthcare education, etc.<sup>49</sup>

Many of the protector-members and Mixed Board members of *La Conciliación* were, simultaneously, members of the first shareholder board of the newspaper. This group included Eugenio Arraiza Baleztena, a lawyer and a member of the town council (1895, 1905); Pedro Uranga Esnaola, who also participated in the creation of the *Caja Rural de Tafalla*; the above-mentioned Silvestre Goicoechea Atáun (1833–1906), who was also President of the *Aguas de Arteta* society; Fermín Iñarra Echenique (1850–1911), a lawyer, “foral” deputy for Aoiz, and the second president of the Chamber of Commerce; or the engineer from Villava, Serapio Huici Lazcano (1868–1953), who was one of the most dynamic businessmen of the times, a shareholder in electricity companies, *Papelera Española*, sugar mills, founder of *Cementos Portland*, among others.

## The Navarrese in Madrid

As before, *La Conciliación* also appealed for support from other Navarrese who held political posts and had influence in the national world. Perhaps the most important protector of *La Conciliación* was the Pamplona politician Francisco Javier González de Castejón y Elío (1848–1919), the Marquis of Vadillo. A professor of natural law

---

47. LCBM 1, 251–252 (1904).

48. Sanchez Aranda, José Javier, *Navarra en 1900: los comienzos del Diario*. Pamplona, 1983, p. 29; Imbuluzqueta Alcasena, Gabriel, *Periódicos navarros en el siglo XIX*. Pamplona, 1993.

49. León Sanz, Pilar, “Private initiatives against social inequalities and health vulnerabilities: the case of *La Conciliación* (Pamplona, 1902–1920)” in Patrice Bourdelais, John Chircop, *Vulnerabilities, Social Inequalities and Health*. Évora, Edições Colibri, forthcoming.

at the *Universidad Central*, the Marquis of Vadillo began his political career as a deputy for Pamplona (1879–1880), was re-elected to the same post in every term of office until 1914, when he was made a senator for life. He belonged to the *Unión Católica* group, and with A. Pidal y Mon joined the Conservative Party, and later took part in the Catholic Congresses in Madrid and Zaragoza. He was the Minister for Grace and Justice (1900–1901), and, again with F. Silvela, he held the portfolio of Agriculture and Public Works (1902–03) and, in 1913, with Eduardo Dato, that of Grace and Justice.<sup>50</sup> Among other things, he obtained an annual State subsidy of two or three thousand pesetas for *La Conciliación*, during the first eight years. He also kept the Society up to date on different governmental decisions as can be seen in the minutes of April 24<sup>th</sup> 1905:

The President read out a telegram from the Most Excellent Marquis of Vadillo notifying the pardon in favour of the accused Resano and Ruba, and the President stated that he had replied expressing his gratitude for his assistance on the matter.<sup>51</sup>

Another Navarrese was the professor of medicine at the *Universidad Central de Madrid*, Antonio Simonena Zabalegui (1861–1941) who was invited to give a lecture “for the workers”, and then made an honorary member of *La Conciliación* in 1904.<sup>52</sup> This honour was shared by Eduardo Sanz y Escartín (1855–1939) from Pamplona, Count of Lizárraga, a politician belonging to the Conservative Party, who, among other posts, was the Civil Governor of Barcelona, president of the permanent commission of the Council for Public Instruction, president of the Institute for Social Reforms and Minister of Labour (1921); etc.<sup>53</sup>

### The support of other public figures

*La Conciliación* had the support of Padre Vicent SJ, and of Padre Manjón. The former, the Valencia Jesuit sociologist Antonio Vicent (1837–1912), was a key figure in Spain because of the range of his ideas and projects for social action, particularly in rural areas. His presence in Pamplona, in 1906, brought about the establishment of the *Consejo Diocesano de las Corporaciones Católico-Obreras* of the Pamplona Diocese and the Navarra Federation of agricultural co-ops. In December 1902, *La Conciliación* contacted the priest and educator Andrés Manjón y Manjón (1846–1923), and requested “data on his system of instruction”. Father Manjón was the creator of the Ave María schools, and was well known for his work on education. At

---

50. Bleiberg, German, *Diccionario de historia de España*. Madrid, 1979.

51. LCBM 1, 316–317 (1905).

52. LCBM 1, 169 (1904).

53. Bleiberg, German, *Diccionario de historia de España*. Madrid, 1979.

the time *La Conciliación* contacted him, he had been made Counsellor for Public Instruction by the government minister Romanones.<sup>54</sup>

Moreover, in order to achieve its educational and recreational objectives, *La Conciliación* organised conferences to which well-known Spanish Social-Christian politicians and activists of the period were invited. Thus, in 1903, for the celebration of their annual festival, they invited Juan Cancio Mena, a Carlist ideologist, who was married to Francisca Sarasate, a sister of the famous Navarrese violinist. He founded the “Academia de San Luis Gonzaga” in Saragossa, an organization which organized cycles of scientific and religious conferences, and he also often wrote (habitually) for the newspaper *El Eco de Navarra*.<sup>55</sup> Later, between 1896 and 1929, another guest of *La Conciliación*, Mariano Baselga, became President of the *Academia de San Luis Gonzaga*.<sup>56</sup> This is recounted in the minutes of April 1905, that they agreed “to extend an invitation to Don Mariano Baselga to make a speech at the *La Conciliación* festival.”<sup>57</sup> Mariano Baselga Ramírez (1865–1938), was a writer, banker and philosopher, and one of the most outstanding figures in Zaragoza in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. Baselga wrote assiduously in the daily press and in numerous publications such as the *Revista de Aragón*, *El Pilar* and *Atheneum*.

On other occasion *La Conciliación* proposed “to initiate relations with Don Víctor Pradera”<sup>58</sup>, a lawyer and engineer who participated actively in both Navarrese and national politics as a Deputy and member of the Tribunal for Constitutional Guarantees during the Second Republic; his publicity work for national newspapers was also important.<sup>59</sup> Other guests of *La Conciliación* were the Royal Academy of Madrid member, Francisco de Paula Arrillaga;<sup>60</sup> the editor of *La Gaceta del Norte* newspaper, José María de Urquijo;<sup>61</sup> José Posse y Villelga, etc.<sup>62</sup> *La Conciliación* kept in touch with all of these people for many years.

---

54. There are many publications about this author, for example: Medina Ocaña, José, *Andrés Manjón*. Madrid, 2006.

55. LCBM 1, 61–63 (1903). Cf.: Sanchez Aranda, Jose Javier, *Navarra en 1900: los comienzos del Diario*. Pamplona, 1983, p. 99.

56. Cf. Pascual de Quinto y de los Rios, Jose, *Las publicaciones de la Real Academia de Nobles y Bellas Artes de San Luis, de Zaragoza, desde su fundación hasta nuestros días (1792–1987); su historia y bibliografía*. Zaragoza, 1988.

57. LCBM 1, 316–317 (1905).

58. LCBM 1, 322–323 (1905).

59. Orella Martínez, José Luis, *Víctor Pradera: un católico en la vida pública de principios de siglo*. Madrid, 2000.

60. LCBM 1, 304–306 (1905).

61. LCBM 1, 304–306; 310–312; 345–346 (1905); LCBM 1, 197–200 (1904).

62. LCBM 1, 345–346 (1905).

## Conclusions

From this date, it is clear that that *La Conciliación* was part of the medical healthcare network in the city, evidences by the relation between power and associationism, and the interconnected interests of the associations, the social groups and the public bodies. In particular we should note the significance of the close contact between the town council and the local societies. *La Conciliación*, and other associations likewise, were linked to local political events and choices. It depended on them for its particular development and in order to organize its social-healthcare programmes throughout the town. We have also seen the relations this Mutual Aid Society had with other local organizations and with those in other cities and even in other countries.

In general, the institutional relations of *La Conciliación* were determined by two issues. The first was the achievement of the Society's objectives: medical-pharmaceutical assistance and the provision of financial aid for unemployed or ill worker-members. Together with this was its work on labour and educational mediation. The second question was that its dealings with other bodies were limited by the characteristics of the associations. In general, and also in Pamplona, the mutual aid and workers' societies of the times were based on the different ideological motivations –Catholic or lay – of their sponsors; and they were either made up specifically of workers or were mixed.<sup>63</sup> In this case, at least during the period studied here, *La Conciliación* only collaborated with similar institutions (Catholic and mixed), with which it shared an authentic support network. Through this kind of association, which attempted to apply the social doctrine of the Papal Encyclical *Rerum novarum* (1891), the Catholic Church directly influenced the people. However – as we have seen – it was not the only model.

Of particular importance in this area were the personal contacts of the protector-members of the Society. They produced the synergy with government bodies which helped *La Conciliación* to participate in the political life, and the physical and social construction of the city. Whatever the case, the records show, precisely, that *La Conciliación* defended its independence of judgement and action energetically; which leads us to support the idea that we cannot entirely link associationism and the powers-that-be. Such an approach would condition our understanding of sociability and the association phenomenon in itself, because it involves the actions of individuals who, independently or in a group, work in certain circumstances, taking into account their personal characteristics and convictions.

---

63. Montero García, Feliciano, Esteban de Vega, Mariano, "Aproximación tipológica al mutualismo popular y obrero en España: el mutualismo asistencial", pp. 457–469 in Santiago Castillo, coord., *La historia social en España: actualidad y perspectivas: actas del I Congreso de la Asociación de Historia Social, Zaragoza, septiembre, 1990*. Madrid, 1991.



*Pilar Leon Sanz* is Associate Professor at the Department of Biomedical Humanities, University of Navarra.

## Acknowledgements

This work is part of the project “La Sociedad de Obreros La Conciliación: escenario de prácticas médicas (1902–1977)”, funded by the Plan de Investigación Universidad de Navarra (2006–09). A summary was presented in the Workshop Welfare, Health and Social Change Welfare, Health and NGOs, Pamplona, 17–18 October, 2008, funded by *PHOENIX– Comparative History of European Public Assistance* (Socrates EU Programme).

## References

- Andrés Gállego, José, “Sobre el inicio de la política obrera contemporánea en Navarra, 1855–1916”, *Príncipe de Viana*, 1978, pp. 335–375.
- Andrés-Gallego, José, *Historia contemporánea de Navarra*. Pamplona, 1982.
- Andrés-Gallego, José, *Pensamiento y acción social de la Iglesia en España*. Madrid, 1984.
- Andres-Gallego, José *Navarra cien años de historia*. Pamplona, 2003.
- Andreu Martínez Gállego, Francesc and Ruzafa, Rafael, “Los socorros mutuos y la cooperación en la España del siglo XIX: actitudes de los poderes públicos y soluciones populares” pp. 101–135 in Santiago Castillo and Rafael Ruzafa, eds., *La previsión social en la historia: actas del VI Congreso de Historia Social de España: Vitoria, 3–5 de julio de 2008*. Siglo XXI de España. Madrid, 2009.
- Aznar Embid, Severino, *El riesgo-enfermedad y las Sociedades de Socorros Mutuos*. Madrid, 1914.
- Bleiberg, German, *Diccionario de historia de España*. Madrid, 1979.
- Calavia Urdániz, Ana, “La Conciliación de Pamplona y sus relaciones con los sindicatos católico-libres (1915–1923)”, *Príncipe de Viana*, XLIX: 10 Anejo (1988): 73–84.
- Carrasco Calvo, Salvador, “Los Sindicatos libres en Navarra”, *Príncipe de Viana, I Congreso de Historia de Navarra de los siglos XVII, XIX y XX*. XLVII: 5, Anejo (1986): 53–67.
- Castrillejo Ibáñez, Félix, “El Círculo Católico de Burgos como modelo de sociabilidad confesional (1883–1936)”, pp. 237–262 in Elena Maza Zorrilla, ed., *Asociacionismo en la España contemporánea: vertientes y análisis interdisciplinar*. Valladolid, 2003.
- Delgado Viñas, Carmen, *Clase obrera, burguesía y conflicto social: Burgos, 1833–1936*. Valladolid, 1993.
- Ferrer Muñoz, Manuel, “Panorama asociativo de Navarra entre 1887 y 1936”, pp. 49–65 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988.
- García-Sanz Marcotegui, Angel, “Elites económicas y políticas en la Restauración. La diversidad de las derechas navarras”, *Historia contemporánea*, 23 (2001), 577–628.
- Imbuluzqueta Alcasena, Gabriel, *Periódicos navarros en el siglo XIX*. Pamplona, 1993.
- León Sanz, Pilar, “Professional Responsibility and the Welfare System in Spain at the Turn of the 19th Century”, *Hygiea Internationalis*, 5: 1 (2006), 75–90.

- León Sanz, Pilar, “La concertación de la asistencia en la enfermedad en La Sociedad de Obreros La Conciliación (1902–1919)”, pp. 97–108 in *Navarra: Memoria e Imagen*. Eunate, Pamplona, 2006.
- León Sanz, Pilar, “Higienismo y previsión social a través de una Sociedad de Socorros Mutuos: el Consultorio de Niños de Pecho de “La Conciliación” (1905–1916)” CD: Comunicaciones, pp. 1–23, in Santiago Castillo and Rafael Ruzafa, eds., *La previsión social en la historia: actas del VI Congreso de Historia Social de España: Vitoria, 3–5 de julio de 2008*. Siglo XXI de España. Madrid, 2009.
- León Sanz, Pilar, “Private initiatives against social inequalities and health vulnerabilities: the case of La Conciliación (Pamplona, 1902–1920)” in Patrice Bourdelais, John Chircop, Vulnerabilities, Social Inequalities and Health. Évora, forthcoming.
- León Sanz, Pilar, “Diversity and Convergence in practice: the Mutual Benefit Societies’ Responses to the 1918–19 Influenza Pandemic in Pamplona”, in Health and Welfare: diversity and convergence in policy and practice, Phoenixtn Conference Athens, 2009.
- Majuelo Gil, Emilio, Pascual Bonis, Angel, *Del catolicismo agrario al cooperativismo empresarial: setenta y cinco años de la Federación de Cooperativas Navarras, 1910–1985*. Madrid, 1991.
- Medina Ocaña, José, *Andrés Manjón*. Madrid, 2006.
- Mina Apat, M Cruz, “Elecciones y partidos en Navarra (1892–1923)”, pp. 111–129 in José Luis García Delgado, *La España de la Restauración. Política, economía legislación y cultura*. Madrid, 1985.
- Montero García, Feliciano, Esteban de Vega, Mariano, “Aproximación tipológica al mutualismo popular y obrero en España: el mutualismo asistencial”, pp. 457–469 in Santiago Castillo, coord., *La historia social en España: actualidad y perspectivas: actas del I Congreso de la Asociación de Historia Social*, Zaragoza, septiembre, 1990. Madrid, 1991.
- Montero, Feliciano, “El debate sobre el intervencionismo y el nacimiento del Instituto Nacional de Previsión (INP)”, pp. 171–196 in: *La previsión social en la historia: actas del VI Congreso de Historia Social de España: Vitoria, 3–5 de julio de 2008*. Madrid: Siglo XXI de España, 2009.
- Olabarri Gortazar, Ignacio, “Notas en torno al problema de la conciencia de identidad colectiva de los navarro en el siglo XIX”, pp. 339–356 in *Congreso de historia de Euskal Herria*, San Sebastián, V, 1988.
- Olabarri Gortazar, Ignacio, “Notas sobre la implantación, la estructura organizativa y el ideario de los partidos del Turno en Navarra, 1901–1923”, *Príncipe de Viana*, 10 Anejo (1988), 317–329.
- Orella Martínez, José Luis, *Víctor Pradera: un católico en la vida pública de principios de siglo*. Madrid, 2000.

- Pascual de Quinto y de los Rios, José, Las publicaciones de la Real Academia de Nobles y Bellas Artes de San Luis, de Zaragoza, desde su fundación hasta nuestros días (1792–1987); su historia y bibliografía. Zaragoza, 1988.
- Pazos, Anton M., El clero navarro (1900–1936): origen social, procedencia geográfica y formación sacerdotal. Pamplona, 1990.
- Pejenaute Goñi, Javier M, “La Federación Católico Social de Navarra y los partidos políticos del momento (1910–1916)”, *Príncipe de Viana, I Congreso de Historia de Navarra de los siglos XVII, XIX y XX*. XXXVII: 5, Anejo (1986): 37–51.
- Pejenaute Goñi, Javier María, “Las cooperativas de Consumo y producción en Navarra (1907–1917)”, pp. 257–271 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988.
- Pejenaute Goñi, Javier María, “Las Sociedades de Socorros Mutuos en Navarra (finales del siglo XIX-Comienzos del XX)”, pp. 273–287 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988.
- Pejenaute Goñi, Javier, “Participación del clero en la Federación navarra de Cajas Rurales”, pp. 369–376 in *Congreso de Historia de Euskal Herria*. Vitoria, VI, 1988.
- Posse y Villelga, José de, Estudios sociales. El socialismo, sus hombres, su organización, sus procedimientos. La Asociación Agrícola, Las Uniones Profesionales. Los Obreros de Tierra de Campos, Bilbao, 1912.
- Sanchez Aranda, José Javier, *Navarra en 1900: los comienzos del Diario*. Pamplona, 1983.
- Tuñón de Lara, Manuel, “Navarra en los movimientos sociales de la Historia Contemporánea de España”, *Príncipe de Viana, I Congreso de Historia de Navarra de los siglos XVII, XIX y XX*. XXXVII: 5, Anejo (1986): 9–22;
- Virto Ibáñez, Juan Jesús, “La UGT de Navarra: algunas aportaciones al estudio del socialismo navarro”, *Príncipe de Viana*. Pamplona, 1989, 395–429.
- Virto, Juan Jesús, “La UGT”, p. 244 in Alfredo Floristán Samanes, *Gran Atlas de Navarra*, II. Caja de Ahorros de Navarra, Pamplona, 1986.